



Manuscript ID JIMA-12-2020-0377.R1 now in your Reviewer Centre - Journal of Islamic Marketing

1 pesan

Journal of Islamic Marketing <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Jum, 19 Feb 2021 pukul 9:27 PM

Balas ke: emi128@uitm.edu.my

Kepada: winengan@uinmataram.ac.id

19-Feb-2021

Dear Dr. Winengan:

Thank you for agreeing to review Manuscript ID JIMA-12-2020-0377.R1 entitled "Business Actors Response to Halal Certification Body Performance Ahead of Enforcement the Halal Regulations" for the Journal of Islamic Marketing. Please try your best to complete your review within the next 2 weeks.

In your review, please answer all questions. On the review page, there is a space for "Comments to Editor" and a space for "Comments to the Author." Please be sure to put your comments to the author in the appropriate space.

To access the manuscript, click this link:

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jima?URL_MASK=978849e0aa034934a022ae8bceb8df0c

You can also access the manuscript by logging in to the Journal of Islamic Marketing - Manuscript Central site at <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jima>. Your case-sensitive USER ID is winengan@uinmataram.ac.id.

For security purposes your password is not listed in this email. If you are unsure of your password you may click the link below to set a new password.

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jima?URL_MASK=b7ec6f0cf42747cb929b1c4cb85695b7

Once you are logged in, the Main Menu will be displayed. Please click on the Reviewer Centre, where you will find the manuscript listed under "Awaiting Reviewer Scores." You can click on the manuscript title from this point or you can click on the "View Details" button to begin reviewing the manuscript.

If you wish to view the manuscript and the review form simultaneously, click on the HTML or PDF icons – the manuscript will open in a new window. Leave the new window open, switch back to the main window, and open the score sheet by clicking on the Score Sheet tab. Follow the instructions for reviewers provided in the Manuscript Central site. I strongly encourage you to elaborate on your review in the space provided. Your specific comments will offer valuable feedback to improve future work. It is essential that you click the "Save" button if you wish to exit the review before you submit it to the Editor. Otherwise, none of the information that you have entered will be saved in the system. When you have completed your review and are ready to submit it to the Editor, click on "Submit."

All communications regarding this manuscript are privileged. Any conflict of interest, suspicion of duplicate publication, fabrication of data or plagiarism must immediately be reported to me.

Thank you for evaluating this manuscript.

Sincerely,
Dr. Emi Normalina Omar
Associate Editor, Journal of Islamic Marketing
emi128@uitm.edu.my

Authors response to reviewers comments:

Dear Prof. Jonathan Wilson,

Thank you for the opportunity to revise our manuscript (Manuscript ID JIMA-12-2020-0377), entitled "Business Actors Response to Halal Certification Body Performance Ahead of Enforcement the Halal Regulations". We would also like to take this opportunity to express our thanks to the reviewers for the positive feedback and helpful comments for correction or modification. We believe have resulted in an improved revised manuscript, which you find in cover letter and we have upload paper revision, also marked on the document that we have changed using the tracking tool. We

have made revisions according to the reviewers comments. some things have changes such as titles, data and others. The manuscript has also improvements in several sentences apart from those we listed below and we have marked it in revisions document. Thank you again for your consideration of our revised manuscript. We very much hope the revised manuscript is accepted for publication in Journal of Islamic Marketing.

Sincerely,
Widia Citra Anggundari

Reviewer 1.

Comment: Your sample of 91 is not correct. Why you are including companies that are not halal certified in your sample? You are not collecting any relevant data for your analysis. Better remove them. Table 1 (page 5) is important but is not complete if I look at the data in figure 3. Figure 3 statistics seems not to be correct. Your second table 1 (page 7) very confusing. I do not understand. Make sure your labels on figures correspond to your first table 1
Answer: Thank you for the advice. We have removed data of companies that are not halal certified. We have changed and added the following sentences in research method "From 126 incoming e-questionnaires, only 78 respondent of business actors had ever been certified and fill in all the questions, dominated by 51.3% of micro-small companies and 26.9% of medium enterproses. When viewed by business groups, it is dominated by the food-beverage industry (59%) and the cosmetics industry (14.1%)". And then, we have chaged the figure 2, figure 4 and figure 5. Table 1 describes the research design that focuses on three things, namely the performance and competence of the certification body and the cost of certification and table 2 explains the justification. Figure 3 describes the constraints faced by business actors in carrying out halal certification.

Additional Question from Reviewer 1

1. Originality: Does the paper contain new and significant information adequate to justify publication?: Yes

Answer: Thank you.

2. Relationship to Literature: Does the paper demonstrate an adequate understanding of the relevant literature in the field and cite an appropriate range of literature sources? Is any significant work ignored?: Ok, you could add in "Creative Destruction of Halal Certification (Bodies)" by M Tieman, G Williams - Islam and Civilisational Renewal (ICR), 2019

Answer: We have added the following sentence in part 3 "According to Tieman and Wiiliams (2019), blockchain technology could replace the role of halal certification, the halal certification process can be easier and more transparant. Blockchain technology is a digital system that contains various information so in the future the blockchain technology can be developed"

3. Methodology: Is the paper's argument built on an appropriate base of theory, concepts, or other ideas? Has the research or equivalent intellectual work on which the paper is based been well designed? Are the methods employed appropriate?: Research methods, mention you use 4 point Likert Scale. Table 1 (design research methods) not complete, as figure 3 not covered. Why are you have data of companies that are never certified within your 91 respondents? They do not contribute to your 4 questions at all. Better remove them if you do not collect any data from them.

Answer: Thank you, we have removed data of companies that are not halal certified, table 1 describes the research design that focuses on three things, namely the performance and competence of the certification body and the cost of certification and table 2 explains the justification. Figure 3 describes the constraints faced by business actors in carrying out halal certification.

4. 4. Results: Are results presented clearly and analysed appropriately? Do the conclusions adequately tie together the other elements of the paper?: Labels on figure 2,4,5 not consistent with table 1. Name of table 1 should be 'research design methods'. I do not understand your second table 1 (I guess table 2?) on page 7. Figure 3: N=91. Percentages probably not correct. Percentage of actors chosen lifetime certification/fee/age/attention/cost.

Answer: Figures 2,4 and 5 are pictures of the percentage of each research focus. Figure 2 explains the results percentage of the halal certification services performance, Figure 4 explains the results percentage of halal certification bodies and Figure 5 explains the result percentage of respondent's opinion regarding the cost of halal certification. The final justification of the three research focuses based on table 2 so that conclusions can be drawn about how the performance of certification services, competency of certification bodies and costs of halal certification in Indonesia.

5. Implications for research, practice and/or society: Does the paper identify clearly any implications for research, practice and/or society? Does the paper bridge the gap between theory and practice? How can the research be used in practice (economic and commercial impact), in teaching, to influence public policy, in research (contributing to the body of knowledge)? What is the impact upon society (influencing public attitudes, affecting quality of life)? Are these implications consistent with the findings and conclusions of the paper?: Expand discussion and conclusion sections for this important research.

Answer: In part of discussion, we have added the following sentences "It is hoped that the cost of certification does not add to burden on business actors, especially for micro and small business actors that have a relatively small capitall turnover rate. The authorized government, in this case BPJPH, needs to prepare a certification cost scenario that can be reached by all types of business actors".

In part of conclusion, we have added the following sentences "BPJPH (government) can make LPPOM-MUI a model that can be adopted in halal certification services, work systems, certification procedures, principles and code of

ethics, and adapted to existing conditions. . This can be in the form of harmonizing the guidelines that have been prepared by the LPPOM-MUI to improve the performance and services of halal certification bodies”.

6. Quality of Communication: Does the paper clearly express its case, measured against the technical language of the field and the expected knowledge of the journal's readership? Has attention been paid to the clarity of expression and readability, such as sentence structure, jargon use, acronyms, etc.: Include Indonesia in title. Maybe better title is: Business actors response to halal certification body performance in Indonesia? In abstract/purpose include the **INDONESIAN GOVERNMENT**.

Introchapter1:

- Indonesian halal certification policy...
- The regulations covers (instead of regulates)
- discuss that implementation of law 33 goes in phases (food, cosmetics, etc.)
- Explain that MUI = NGO and BPJPH = government.

Answer: Thank you for your reviewed. We have changed the title to “Business Actors Response to Halal Certification Body Performance in Indonesia”. We have added the word in abstract/purpose “The implementation of the mandatory halal certification policy by the Indonesian Government of October 17, 2019, at least needs to be reviewed first, how is the response of business actors to halal certification services that have been carried out by previous Halal Certification Bodies in Indonesia. This can provide an overview of the extent to which the quality of the appointed authority's services, the competence of the institution, and the costs of certification.

We have changed the sentence in introduction: The regulation covers the enforcement of mandatory halal-certified products. We added the sentence in paragraph one: Products referred to in Law No. 33 of 2014 are goods or services related to food, beverages, medicines, cosmetics, chemical products, biological products, genetic engineering products, and consumer goods that are used, used or utilized by the community. The implementation of the types of products that are halal certified is regulated in stages. In connection with the implementation of Law No. 33 of 2014, business actors are the main elements and factors of the policy.

In paragraph three, we have added the sentence: LPPOM MUI is non government organization that assist the government related to interest of muslims while the BPJP is part of the government.

Reviewer 2.

Comment: The author must develop the following parts:

Methodology: to describe reliability and thenticiy methods of the data.

Results: how the business units knew that the Halal certification bodies were efficient and effective

Suggestion: specific suggestions that what the society has to do, and what is the message to the global markets/business units.

Answer: Thank you. In the methodology, we have changed and added the following sentences “From 126 incoming e-questionnaires, only 78 respondent of business actors had ever been certified and fill in all the questions, dominated by 51.3% of micro-small companies and 26.9% of medium enterproses. When viewed by business groups, it is dominated by the food-beverage industry (59%) and the cosmetics industry (14.1%)”. The number of respondents in this study is expected to represent all business actors in Indonesia. Respondents in this research are business actors who have carried out halal certification, but there are some that are not consistent due to cost issues. In discussions, we have added the sentences: “ Business actors are also expected to consistently carry out halal certification so that they can protect consumers from non-halal products”.

Additional Question from Reviewer 2

1. Originality: Does the paper contain new and significant information adequate to justify publication?: The article does not contain new knowledge but it adds its contribution in the existing research basket, I rank its originality as an "average".

Answer: Thank you for the assessment.

2. Relationship to Literature: Does the paper demonstrate an adequate understanding of the relevant literature in the field and cite an appropriate range of literature sources? Is any significant work ignored?: The author(s) has/have reviewed sufficient literature for the article.

Answer: Thank you for the assessment.

3. Methodology: Is the paper's argument built on an appropriate base of theory, concepts, or other ideas? Has the research or equivalent intellectual work on which the paper is based been well designed? Are the methods employed appropriate?: Collecting data through online questionnaires, is always pose a question of its reliability, the author(s) did not describe well about the reliability of the data collected.

Answer: Regarding the reliability of data collected, respondents are stakeholders who are familiar with halal certification and some respondents are halal certified but are not consistent due to cost issues.

4. Results: Are results presented clearly and analysed appropriately? Do the conclusions adequately tie together the other elements of the paper?: The author/s has/ve describe the findings, description about business men is ok..., but here questions arise that how a business men knew the that Halal Certification bodies are performing well and are well efficient nationally. The author/s should provide the details that which cross questions asked to the business units about authenticity of the information acquired.

Answer: In this research, respondents were business actors who carried out of halal certification, respondents were directly involved in the process carried out by the halal certification bodies at that time, LPPOM MUI. LPPOM MUI is a halal certification body that has been running before the establishment of BPJPH. The performance of LPPOM MUI

can be seen from the large number of regional branches located in 34 provinces in Indonesia with 1058 auditors (February 2018), accredited by the National Accredited Committee (KAN) LSH-001-IDN, which has a long-established halal standard, namely HAS 23000 which has been recognized and adopted by 42 halal certification bodies in 25 countries, LPPOM-MUI also certified of ISO 17065 that it can run as a certification body according to international standards, and an online web application-based service system called Cerol, which makes the audit process easier for business actors in Indonesia. LPPOM-MUI established since 1989 by the government as the only institution authorized to audits, stipulated fatwas and issued halal certificates from 2001 to 2019

5. Implications for research, practice and/or society: Does the paper identify clearly any implications for research, practice and/or society? Does the paper bridge the gap between theory and practice? How can the research be used in practice (economic and commercial impact), in teaching, to influence public policy, in research (contributing to the body of knowledge)? What is the impact upon society (influencing public attitudes, affecting quality of life)? Are these implications consistent with the findings and conclusions of the paper?: Yes, I think the article can bridge the gap between theory and practice in Halal business, as there is increase in the demand of Halal products globally.
Answer: Thank you.

6. Quality of Communication: Does the paper clearly express its case, measured against the technical language of the field and the expected knowledge of the journal's readership? Has attention been paid to the clarity of expression and readability, such as sentence structure, jargon use, acronyms, etc.: The quality of the draft is good.
Answer: Thank you for the assessment.



Thank you for submitting your review of Manuscript ID JIMA-01-2022-0004 for the Journal of Islamic Marketing

1 pesan

Journal of Islamic Marketing <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Min, 6 Feb 2022 pukul 6:47 PM

Balas ke: faridah_hh@yahoo.com

Kepada: winengan@uinmataram.ac.id

06-Feb-2022

Dear Dr. winengan,

Thank you for submitting your review of JIMA-01-2022-0004 for Journal of Islamic Marketing. We are very grateful for the contribution you have made to the journal by providing your review. We recognise the value that is added by our reviewers and would therefore like to thank you for your work, by granting you free personal access to up to 40 Emerald journal articles (excluding Backfiles) within a three-month period.

Early next month, we will send an email that will contain all the information you need to activate your personal free access.

Once you have received this email, all you will need to do is:

- click the link in the e-mail: this will take you directly to the Emerald log-in page
- If you have an Emerald MyProfile log in, simply log on using these details (this is different to the log in you use for ScholarOne)
- If you do not have an Emerald MyProfile, you can register with us there and then to get your free personal access to Emerald content. Instructions on how to contact us to set up your Emerald MyProfile will be in the email we send next month.

We would also like to offer you a 30% DISCOUNT on all Emerald books available for purchase from the EMERALD BOOKSTORE. To take advantage of this offer please visit <http://books.emeraldinsight.com/> and then enter the code REVIEW at the checkout.

On behalf of the Editors of Journal of Islamic Marketing, we appreciate the valuable and efficient contribution that each reviewer gives to the Journal and we hope that we may call upon you again to review future manuscripts.

Yours sincerely,

Prof. Faridah Haji Hassan
Associate Editor, Journal of Islamic Marketing
faridah_hh@yahoo.com, faridah_hh@yahoo.com



Thank you for submitting your review of Manuscript ID JIMA-12-2020-0377.R1 for the Journal of Islamic Marketing

1 pesan

Journal of Islamic Marketing <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Jum, 19 Feb 2021 pukul 10:34 PM

Balas ke: emi128@uitm.edu.my

Kepada: winengan@uinmataram.ac.id

19-Feb-2021

Dear Dr. winengan,

Thank you for submitting your review of JIMA-12-2020-0377.R1 for Journal of Islamic Marketing. We are very grateful for the contribution you have made to the journal by providing your review. We recognise the value that is added by our reviewers and would therefore like to thank you for your work, by granting you free personal access to up to 40 Emerald journal articles (excluding Backfiles) within a three-month period.

Early next month, we will send an email that will contain all the information you need to activate your personal free access.

Once you have received this email, all you will need to do is:

- click the link in the e-mail: this will take you directly to the Emerald log-in page
- If you have an Emerald MyProfile log in, simply log on using these details (this is different to the log in you use for ScholarOne)
- If you do not have an Emerald MyProfile, you can register with us there and then to get your free personal access to Emerald content. Instructions on how to contact us to set up your Emerald MyProfile will be in the email we send next month.

We would also like to offer you a 30% DISCOUNT on all Emerald books available for purchase from the EMERALD BOOKSTORE. To take advantage of this offer please visit <http://books.emeraldinsight.com/> and then enter the code REVIEW at the checkout.

On behalf of the Editors of Journal of Islamic Marketing, we appreciate the valuable and efficient contribution that each reviewer gives to the Journal and we hope that we may call upon you again to review future manuscripts.

Sincerely,
Dr. Emi Normalina Omar
Associate Editor, Journal of Islamic Marketing
emi128@uitm.edu.my



Manuscript ID JIMA-01-2022-0004 now in your Reviewer Centre - Journal of Islamic Marketing

1 pesan

Journal of Islamic Marketing <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Kam, 6 Jan 2022 pukul 8:43 AM

Balas ke: faridah_hh@yahoo.com

Kepada: winengan@uinmataram.ac.id

06-Jan-2022

Dear Dr. winengan winengan

Thank you for agreeing to review Manuscript ID JIMA-01-2022-0004 entitled "Consumer Preference in Purchasing Halal Food: the Role of Religious Commitment" for the Journal of Islamic Marketing. Please try your best to complete your review within the next 2 weeks.

In your review, please answer all questions. On the review page, there is a space for "Comments to Editor" and a space for "Comments to the Author." Please be sure to put your comments to the author in the appropriate space.

To access the manuscript, click this link:

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jima?URL_MASK=970d0de10dd0407a9f4b3eda42a70b47

You can also access the manuscript by logging in to the Journal of Islamic Marketing - Manuscript Central site at <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jima>. Your case-sensitive USER ID is winengan@uinmataram.ac.id. For security purposes your password is not listed in this email. If you are unsure of your password you may click the link below to set a new password.

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jima?URL_MASK=3990449a143146bdab4620cf57b51d18

Once you are logged in, the Main Menu will be displayed. Please click on the Reviewer Centre, where you will find the manuscript listed under "Awaiting Reviewer Scores." You can click on the manuscript title from this point or you can click on the "View Details" button to begin reviewing the manuscript.

If you wish to view the manuscript and the review form simultaneously, click on the HTML or PDF icons – the manuscript will open in a new window. Leave the new window open, switch back to the main window, and open the score sheet by clicking on the Score Sheet tab. Follow the instructions for reviewers provided in the Manuscript Central site. I strongly encourage you to elaborate on your review in the space provided. Your specific comments will offer valuable feedback to improve future work. It is essential that you click the "Save" button if you wish to exit the review before you submit it to the Editor. Otherwise, none of the information that you have entered will be saved in the system. When you have completed your review and are ready to submit it to the Editor, click on "Submit."

All communications regarding this manuscript are privileged. Any conflict of interest, suspicion of duplicate publication, fabrication of data or plagiarism must immediately be reported to me.

Thank you for evaluating this manuscript.

Sincerely,
Prof. Faridah Haji Hassan
Associate Editor, Journal of Islamic Marketing
faridah_hh@yahoo.com, faridah_hh@yahoo.com



Invitation to Review for the Journal of Islamic Marketing

1 pesan

Journal of Islamic Marketing <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>
Balas ke: emi128@uitm.edu.my
Kepada: winengan@uinmataram.ac.id

Jum, 5 Feb 2021 pukul 3:42 PM

05-Feb-2021

Dear Dr. Winengan:

Manuscript ID JIMA-12-2020-0377.R1 entitled "Business Actors Response to Halal Certification Body Performance Ahead of Enforcement the Halal Regulations" has been revised and submitted to the Journal of Islamic Marketing.

I invite you to review this manuscript. The abstract appears at the end of this letter. Please let me know as soon as possible if you will be able to accept my invitation to review. If you are unable to review at this time, I would appreciate you recommending another expert reviewer. Please click the appropriate link below to automatically register your reply with our online manuscript submission and review system.

*** PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm. ***

Agreed: https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jima?URL_MASK=99fae6004d6a4dbd92a69bdb7bd27dc

Declined: https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jima?URL_MASK=6cacff27efca4812bb25aa66134f7bf

Once you accept my invitation to review this manuscript, you will be notified via e-mail about how to access Manuscript Central, our online manuscript submission and review system. You will then have access to the manuscript and reviewer instructions in your Reviewer Centre.

I realize that our expert reviewers greatly contribute to the high standards of the Journal, and I thank you for your present and/or future participation.

Sincerely,
Dr. Emi Normalina Omar
Associate Editor, Journal of Islamic Marketing
emi128@uitm.edu.my

MANUSCRIPT DETAILS

TITLE: Business Actors Response to Halal Certification Body Performance Ahead of Enforcement the Halal Regulations

ABSTRACT:

The implementation of the mandatory halal certification policy by the Indonesian Government as of October 17, 2019, at least needs to be reviewed first, how is the response of business actors to halal certification services that have been carried out by previous Halal Certification Bodies in Indonesia. This can provide an overview of the extent to which the quality of the appointed authority's services, the competence of the institution, and the costs of certification.

These three things are important findings for the appointment of the next authority agency based on the implementation review. Respondents in this study were small, medium, and large business actors, spread across 11 provinces in Indonesia. In this study, the data were obtained from 91 complete questionnaires.

The results of the analysis found that 81.4% of business actors were very satisfied with the performance of the certification service of halal certification bodies, 80.3% of business actors stated that the halal certification body was a component and 59.4% of business actors stated that the cost of halal certification was proportional to the quality of the services provided.

Policy maker can benefit from this study which getting recommendations regarding halal certification services These findings contribute to describing the response of business actors to halal certification services



Invitation to Review for the Journal of Islamic Marketing

1 pesan

Journal of Islamic Marketing <onbehalfof@manuscriptcentral.com>

Sen, 8 Mar 2021 pukul 10:23 PM

Balas ke: emi128@uitm.edu.my

Kepada: winengan@uinmataram.ac.id

08-Mar-2021

Dear Dr. winengan:

Manuscript ID JIMA-12-2020-0377.R2 entitled "Business Actors Response to Halal Certification Body Performance in Indonesia" has been revised and submitted to the Journal of Islamic Marketing.

I invite you to review this manuscript. The abstract appears at the end of this letter. Please let me know as soon as possible if you will be able to accept my invitation to review. If you are unable to review at this time, I would appreciate you recommending another expert reviewer. Please click the appropriate link below to automatically register your reply with our online manuscript submission and review system.

*** PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm. ***

Agreed: https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jima?URL_MASK=167d0d72dd5648bdb54ca87068055a69

Declined: https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jima?URL_MASK=9f8ca700cda44668a398ed59a8f2efcf

Once you accept my invitation to review this manuscript, you will be notified via e-mail about how to access Manuscript Central, our online manuscript submission and review system. You will then have access to the manuscript and reviewer instructions in your Reviewer Centre.

I realize that our expert reviewers greatly contribute to the high standards of the Journal, and I thank you for your present and/or future participation.

Sincerely,
Dr. Emi Normalina Omar
Associate Editor, Journal of Islamic Marketing
emi128@uitm.edu.my

MANUSCRIPT DETAILS

TITLE: Business Actors Response to Halal Certification Body Performance in Indonesia

ABSTRACT:

The implementation of the mandatory halal certification policy by the Indonesian Government as of October 17, 2019, at least needs to be reviewed first, how is the response of business actors to halal certification services that have been carried out by previous Halal Certification Bodies in Indonesia. This can provide an overview of the extent to which the quality of the appointed authority's services, the competence of the institution, and the costs of certification.

This study uses a quantitative descriptive non-parametric statistical analysis by taking non-probability survey samples with a freely distributed distribution method with focus on 3 things: response to halal certification services, to competence of Halal Certification Bodies (LPPOM-MUI), and to Halal Certification service fee. Respondents in this study were small, medium, and large business actors, spread across 11 area provinces in Indonesia. In this study the data were obtained from 78 complete questionnaires.

The results that 81.4% of business actors were very satisfied with the performance of the certification service of halal certification bodies, 80.3% of business actors stated that the halal certification body was a competent and 59.4% of business actors stated that the halal certification fee was proportional to quality of services provided.

Policy maker can benefit from this study which getting recommendations regarding halal certification services. These findings contribute to describing the response of business actors to halal certification services and have not been doing before with same subject and object of the research.