



Saparudin UIN Mataram <saparudin@uinmataram.ac.id>

IIER New Submission: Saparudin

1 message

Saparudin UIN Mataram <saparudin@uinmataram.ac.id>

Mon, Feb 6, 2023 at 3:45
PM

To: editor@iier.org.au

Dear IIER Editor

I am writing to submit our manuscript entitled, "The Rising of Islamic Movements and Dilemmas of Contemporary Islamic Education in Lombok, East Indonesia" for consideration for publication in Issues in Educational Research (IIER) Journal.

Because our findings could be explicating the using of three kind of curricula and its impact on the quality of Islamic education, they are likely to be of great interest to the vision scientists, researchers, and lecturers who read your journal.

This manuscript describes original work and is not under consideration by any other journal.

Thank you for receiving our manuscript and considering it for review.
We appreciate your time and look forward to your response.

Kind Regards,

Saparudin



IIER_New_Submission_Saparudin.docx

89K



Saparudin UIN Mataram <saparudin@uinmataram.ac.id>

Re: [Editor] IIER New Submission: Saparudin (#61)

1 message

Roger Atkinson <rjatkenson@bigpond.com>
To: Saparudin UIN Mataram <saparudin@uinmataram.ac.id>
Cc: editor@iier.org.au

Wed, Feb 8, 2023 at 8:05 AM

Hello Dr Saparudin,

Thank you very much. We acknowledge receipt of your submission to IIER.

Date: 7/2/23

Title: The Rising of Islamic Movements and Dilemmas of Contemporary Islamic Education in Lombok, East Indonesia

Authors: Saparudin (corres author) (Universitas Islam Negeri Mataram), Arhanuddin Salim (Institut Agama Islam Negeri Manado, Indonesia)

Original filename: IIER_New_Submission_Saparudin.docx

File reading check: No problems.

We will place your submission into IIER's review process and in due course advise you on the outcome. Review times may vary from 2-4 weeks to 2-4 months, depending upon an initial assessment by IIER Editorial staff.

* Initial assessment: May lead to advice from IIER Editorial staff about reasons for not accepting, and giving suggestions about how to improve for another journal (2-4 weeks) or may be followed by an external review.

* External review: This process (up to 4 months) may lead to acceptance, or to rejection for reasons given by the external reviewers.

We thank you for submitting your work to IIER.

Best wishes,

Dr Roger Atkinson

Associate Editor, IIER

Duty Co-editor for acknowledging submissions, January 2023

Please address any queries to editor@iier.org.au, as another member of the IIER Editorial staff may be attending to the review process for your submission.

<http://www.iier.org.au/>

> On 6 Feb 2023, at 3:45 pm, Saparudin UIN Mataram <saparudin@uinmataram.ac.id> wrote:

>

> Dear IIER Editor

>

> I am writing to submit our manuscript entitled, "The Rising of Islamic Movements and Dilemmas of Contemporary Islamic Education in Lombok, East Indonesia" for consideration for publication in Issues in Educational Research (IIER) Journal.

>
> Because our findings could be explicating the using of three kind of curricula and its impact on the quality of Islamic education, they are likely to be of great interest to the vision scientists, researchers, and lecturers who read your journal.
>
> This manuscript describes original work and is not under consideration by any other journal.
>
> Thank you for receiving our manuscript and considering it for review.
> We appreciate your time and look forward to your response.
>
> Kind Regards,
>
> Saparudin
>
> <IIER_New_Submission_Saparudin.docx>--
> Editor mailing list



Saparudin UIN Mataram <saparudin@uinmataram.ac.id>

IIER_Revised_Saparudin

2 messages

Saparudin UIN Mataram <saparudin@uinmataram.ac.id>
To: rjatkinson@bigpond.com

Tue, May 16, 2023 at 8:30 AM

Dear IIER Editor,

I am attaching the manuscript that has been revised based on the reviewer feedbacks.

Regard,

Sapar

 **IIER_REVISED_Saparudin_The Rise.docx**
101K

Mail Delivery Subsystem <mailer-daemon@googlemail.com>
To: saparudin@uinmataram.ac.id

Tue, May 16, 2023 at 8:30 AM

Message not delivered

There was a problem delivering your message to **rjatkinson@bigpond.com**. See the technical details below, or try resending in a few minutes.

The response from the remote server was:

550 5.7.23 Message rejected due to SPF policy - Please check policy for uinmataram.ac.id. IB301 i{5d76c7e0-28da-4933-abb0-316289500059}

Final-Recipient: rfc822; rjatkinson@bigpond.com

Action: failed

Status: 5.7.23

Remote-MTA: dns; extmail.bigpond.com. (203.42.40.138, the server for the domain bigpond.com.)

Diagnostic-Code: smtp; 550-5.7.23 Message rejected due to SPF policy - Please check policy for 550 5.7.23 uinmataram.ac.id. IB301 i{5d76c7e0-28da-4933-abb0-316289500059}

Last-Attempt-Date: Mon, 15 May 2023 17:30:53 -0700 (PDT)

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Saparudin UIN Mataram <saparudin@uinmataram.ac.id>

To: rjatkinson@bigpond.com

Cc:

Bcc:

Date: Tue, 16 May 2023 08:30:37 +0800

Subject: IIER_Revised_Saparudin

----- Message truncated -----



Saparudin UIN Mataram <saparudin@uinmataram.ac.id>

IIER review advice: Saparudin and Salim (#61)

1 message

Roger Atkinson <rjatkenson@bigpond.com>

Mon, May 8, 2023 at 12:26 AM

To: Saparudin UIN Mataram <saparudin@uinmataram.ac.id>

Cc: Editor <editor@iier.org.au>

Hello Dr Saparudin,

We are pleased to advise that IIER has accepted your article submitted on 6 February 2023, "The Rising of Islamic Movements and Dilemmas of Contemporary Islamic Education in Lombok, East Indonesia", subject to revisions as specified below in Reviewer 1 comments and IIER editorial staff notes.

We regret that at present only one review is available, but as the advice contained in it is positive (Reviewer 1 comments below), and concurs with earlier advice from IIER's initial assessment procedure, we have elected to proceed to accept without waiting for a second review, which could impose a significant delay owing to the current low availability of reviewers.

Please aim towards inclusion in IIER 33(2), estimated date of publication late June 2023, submitting your revised version before about mid-May 2023 (direct to rjatkenson@bigpond.com will be appropriate). Otherwise, we expect that IIER 33(3) will be published in September 2023. If you have queries arising during your revisions, please email direct to rjatkenson@bigpond.com, who will be IIER's copy editor for 33(2).

We thank you for submitting to IIER.

Yours sincerely,

Dr Roger Atkinson

Duty Co-editor for despatching review advice, March 2023

<http://www.iier.org.au/>

Reviewer 1 comments #61

Recommendation: Accept subject to major revisions

Submission #61 impresses with its depiction of "competing curricula" as a key "dilemma" for Islamic education in Indonesian schools. Although its main topic has been represented extensively in IIER (see note 1 below for several examples), #61 offers a distinctive addition to the IIER coverage, particularly in its comparative approach to the three curricula.

However, the comparisons require some further explanations and clarification. Consider Table 5, which gives a concise summary of the contrasts. The accompanying text or specific notes attached to the bottom of the table should explain "38 hrs/week". First, why such a high number of classroom hours? Second, readers may presume that "38" is derived from Table 2, where perhaps only about 10 hrs/week is identified as "Science and technology". Third, is this for all school years, or for secondary only, or for upper secondary only? An improved explanation is needed, always keeping in mind the question, "Will international readers who may have little familiarity with Indonesia's

education systems understand this (table, sentence, paragraph, etc.)?

It is usual in the Conclusion section to include a paragraph that identifies limitations in the research, and suggestions for high priority further research. One important limitation is that you have not investigated the extent to which teachers implement the prescribed curriculum. To what extent do teachers adapt the curriculum to better serve their students and their community? Try Google Scholar searches for the keywords "curriculum implementation" and "curriculum fidelity" (that may help you to identify key priorities for further research).

Notes

1. Representation of this article's main topic in recent issues of IIER may be explored using this or similar Google Scholar searches (copy and paste into web reader address box):
https://scholar.google.com.au/scholar?as_q=Islamic+religious+education&as_epq=&as_oq=&as_eq=&as_occt=any&as_sauthors=&as_publication=%22issues+in+educational+research%22&as_ylo=2017&as_yhi=&hl=en&as_sdt=0%2C5

About 26 results since 2017 - diverse perspectives and country contexts are represented, perhaps notably:

* Toghyani Khorasgani, A., Rahmani, J. & Keshtiaray, N. (2023). Curriculum and economic development: A comparative study of secondary education in Iran and G7 countries. *Issues in Educational Research*, 33(1), 390-413. <http://www.iier.org.au/iier33/toghyani-khorasgani.pdf> ["... Iran lacks economic-oriented content and objectives that connect to occupation, markets, needs of the community..."]

* Gholaminejad, R. & Raeisi-Vanani, A. (2021). English language teaching in Iranian mainstream schools: Pedagogical, societal and government policy environments. *Issues in Educational Research*, 31(1), 111-129. <http://www.iier.org.au/iier31/gholaminejad.pdf> ["... the political context of Iranian society - with state decision-makers staunchly adhering to their peremptory control and management of the educational realms on the one hand, and the shortcomings in the existing equipment and facilities of the governmental educational system on the other - will put mainstream schools in a difficult position"]

* Kimanen, A. (2019). Truth claims, commitment and openness in Finnish Islamic and Lutheran religious education classrooms. *Issues in Educational Research*, 29(1), 141-157. <http://www.iier.org.au/iier29/kimanen.pdf> ["Teachers should not impose certain belief systems on their pupils..."]

2. Check carefully that all in-text citations appear in the References list. For example, p. 12 "National Exam Results, 2016-2021"; p. 8 "Table 2. Ministry of National Education Curriculum for Senior High School/Madrasah Aliyah (2006)"; p. 7 "(Azyumardi Azra, 2006)"; p. 7 "(National Education System Law, 2003)".

IIER editorial staff notes

a. Reference formats. For international readers and in accord with IIER being an English language journal, we place some limitations on formats. To illustrate with several examples:

i. Suhaimy, 'Abd al-Salām. (1423). *Kun Salafiyyan 'ala al-Jaddah*. tp.

- References must use dating of year that is conventional in English. 1423 -> 2002

- An article title in a language other than English must have an English translation appended in [] square brackets.

- Wherever possible, references should have a web address appended.

ii. H. Bashori A. Hakim. (2014). *Wawasan Kebangsaan Kelompok Salafi Di Nusa Tenggara Barat: Studi Kelompok Salafi Di Pondok Pesantren Daarusy-Syifaa'*. *Harmoni*, 13(2), 70-86.

- append web address <https://jurnalharmoni.kemenag.go.id/index.php/harmoni/article/view/127/110>

- insert English translation of title: [The national insight of Salafi Groups in West Nusa Tenggara: A study of Salafi Groups at the Daarusy-Syifaa Islamic Boarding School] (from Google Translate - can

you improve?)

- H. Bashori A. Hakim could be better as Hakim, B. A. Look for instances of how an author self cites, for guidance on name format.

b. Title: "The Rising of Islamic Movements and Dillemas of Contemporary Islamic Education in Lombok, East Indonesia" - need to improve grammar, correct spelling, and control line length.

Please consider:

- The rise of Islamic movements and dilemmas for contemporary Islamic education: A study in Lombok, Indonesia

- The rising of Islamic movements creating a dilemma for Islamic education: A study in Lombok, East Indonesia

(both suggestions accord with IIER house style for titles - no more than two lines, each not exceeding 13.6 cm in Arial 14 point bold).

c. Article length. At about 6649 words including references but not including 104 words in bios, your article is well under IIER's specification of 7500 words. Reviewer 1's advice is very helpful, and you can add new text and references when implementing that advice. However, do not exceed about 8000 words.



Saparudin UIN Mataram <saparudin@uinmataram.ac.id>

Re: [Editor] *SPAM*** IER_Revised_Saparudin (#61)**

1 message

Roger Atkinson <rjatkenson@bigpond.com>

Wed, May 17, 2023 at 12:11 AM

To: Saparudin UIN Mataram <saparudin@uinmataram.ac.id>

Cc: Editor <editor@iier.org.au>

Hello Dr Saparudin,

Received, thank you for the prompt return and good attention to detail. All seems in good order and at this stage we do not have any questions arising. Your article will appear in IER 33(2), estimated date of publication late June 2023. As usual I am IER's copy editor for 33(2) and in due course you will receive a proof reading copy from Clare McBeath.

I'm uncertain about the identity of the email server or spam blocking software that inserted "***SPAM***" into the subject line. However, I want to avoid wasting precious time on finding out more about it. So we tend to tolerate such occurrences as instances of the failure of AI (artificial intelligence) to find sensible actions concerning "spam" or "junk email".

Best wishes - and thank you again for an insightful contribution. Looking through the large number of contributions we receive from Islamic or Islamic majority countries (nearly all of these must remain confidential because they were not accepted - IER's acceptance rate is low, see Editorial 33-2, estimated date of publication late June 2023), it does seem to us that Indonesian academics could collectively gain recognition as world leaders in scholarly investigation of the topic of "critical Islamic religious education" (Saada & Magadlah, 2021).

Roger

Dr Roger Atkinson
Associate Editor, IER
<http://www.iier.org.au/>

> On 16 May 2023, at 2:38 pm, Saparudin UIN Mataram <saparudin@uinmataram.ac.id> wrote:

>

> Dear IER Editor,

> I am attaching the manuscript that has been revised based on the reviewer feedbacks.

> Regard,

> Sapar

> <IER_REVISIED_Saparudin_The Rise.docx>--

> Editor mailing list

> Editor@iier.org.au

> http://iier.org.au/mailman/listinfo/editor_iier.org.au